

## Menachos – Simanim

### פרק א – כל המנחות

#### דף יב – Daf 12

##### 1. חוץ לזמנו or חוץ למקומו of a *minchah* performed with intent of עבודות

The next Mishnah teaches that if one performs *kemitzah* with the intent to eat its שירים (or a כזית of its שירים), בחוץ, outside the עזרה, or to burn the קומץ (or a כזית of it), לבונה, the *minchah* is פסול, but does not obligate ברת for eating it. If he intended to eat שירים or burn קומץ the next day, it is פיגול, and obligates ברת. The Mishnah presents a rule: anyone who performs *kemitzah*, places the *kometz* in a כלי שרת, brings it, or burns it on the מזבח, intending להאכל דבר שדרכו להקטיר, – *to eat something meant to be eaten*, or להקטיר דבר שדרכו להאכל, – *or to burn something meant to be burned*, חוץ למקומו, – *outside its prescribed place*, it is פסול but does not obligate ברת, but if he intended to eat it or burn it לזמנו, חוץ לזמנו, – *beyond its time*, it is פיגול and obligates *kares*, and בלבד שיקריב המתיר במצותו, – *provided that the permitter is offered according to its requirements*, i.e., that the *kometz* (which permits the *minchah*'s שירים to be eaten) was offered without additional disqualifying intent. The Mishnah illustrates numerous cases of this principle.

##### 2. If burning the *kometz* for שירים שחסרו can effect פיגול or remove מעילה

The Gemara asks, according to the opinion that שירים שחסרו – if the *remnants became deficient* between the *kemitzah* and הקטרה, one may still burn the *kometz*, about which we rule that the שירים may not be eaten, מהו – *what is the halachah whether burning [the kometz] will effectively establish piggul* – ולפקינהו מידי מעילה, – *and remove them from being subject to me'ilah?*

Rav Huna says that even though Rebbe Akiva said זריקה ליוצא – *throwing the blood is effective* to remove *me'ilah* from *kodashim* which left the עזרה before זריקה, that is only for the disqualification of יוצא, – *since [the korban] still exists*, – *and its disqualification is external* (i.e., the airspace of Yerushalayim), but regarding חסרון – *deficiency*, דפסולא דגופיה הוא, – *which is an intrinsic disqualification*, the הקטרה would not remove *me'ilah*. Rava says the opposite: even though Rebbe Eliezer says זריקה does not remove *me'ilah* from יוצא, that is only for יוצא, – *which is not inside* the עזרה, but חסרון, which is inside the עזרה, *zerikah* would remove it from *me'ilah*. Rava later retracts based on a Baraisa, but Abaye deflects his proof.

##### 3. אין אכילה והקטרה מצטרפין

The next Mishnah states: לאכול בחצי זית ולהקטיר בחצי זית – if one intended *to eat a half-zayis* (of שירים) *and to burn a half-zayis* (of *kometz*) the next day, בשר, – *[the minchah] is valid*, – *because intentions for eating and burning do not combine* to a כזית. The Gemara infers that these intentions do not combine because they are about different acts, מצטרף, – *but if he intends to eat [a חצי זית of שירים] and eat [a חצי זית of] something not normally eaten* (i.e., the קומץ), it would combine to invalidate the *minchah*. But the previous Mishnah taught that intent to eat דבר שאין דרכו לאכול is not effective at all!? Rebbe Yirmiyah says this Mishnah is Rebbe Eliezer, who disagrees and holds מזבח [לאכילת] – *one can have intent about something meant for human consumption to be consumed by the mizbeiach*, – *and have intent about something meant for the mizbeiach's consumption to be consumed by a person*. Therefore, these two intentions can combine. Abaye explains the Mishnah differently.

#### Siman – Twelve Brothers

The oldest of **twelve Kohen brothers** who helped his siblings remember that חוץ לזמנו *with a minchah is chayav* ברת *whereas חוץ למקומו is not* by writing the word "ברת" on a big clock, and then challenged them by holding up a bowl where the שירים had become deficient between קמיצה and the הקטרה and asked if burning the *kometz* can effect פיגול or remove מעילה, had his two youngest brothers dressed in אכילה and הקטרה costumes stand far away from each other to teach that אכילה והקטרה אין מצטרפין.



The oldest of **twelve Kohen brothers** who helped his siblings remember that **חוץ לזמנו** with a **minchah** is **chayav** כרת whereas **חוץ למקומו** is not by writing the word "כרת" on a big clock, and then challenged them by holding up a bowl where the **שירים** had become deficient between the **קמיצה** and the **הקטרה** and asked if burning the **kometz** can effect **פיגול** or **remove מעילה**, had his two youngest brothers dressed in **אכילה** and **הקטרה** costumes stand far away from each other to teach that **אכילה והקטרה אין מצטרפין**.

### 3 things to remember

1. עבודות of a **minchah** performed with intent of **חוץ למקומו** or
2. If burning the **kometz** for **שירים** שחור can effect **פיגול** or **remove מעילה**
3. אין אכילה והקטרה מצטרפין

